DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 281 870 TM 870 267

AUTHOR Moseley, James L.
TITLE Criteria for Evaluating Instructional Products.
PUB DATE [87]
NOTE 7p.
PUB TYPE Tests/Evaluation Instruments (160)

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC01 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS *Check Lists; Elementary Secondary Education; *Evaluation Criteria; Higher Education; *Instructional Material Evaluation; *Rating Scales; Summative Evaluation; Textbook Evaluation

ABSTRACT

This five-page checklist presents a rating scale approach to evaluating instructional products and educational media. Each item may be checked yes, no, uncertain, or not applicable. Fifteen categories of evaluation criteria are included: (1) purpose; (2) objectives; (3) front end analysis; (4) prerequisite skills and knowledge requirements; (5) content; (6) audience; (7) strategies and materials; (8) technical aspects; (9) student evaluation; (10) overall design; (11) field testing; (12) attractiveness and ease of use; (13) classroom management; (14) authorship; and (15) costs. (GDC)

****
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
****

ED281870

CRITERIA FOR EVALUATING INSTRUCTIONAL PRODUCTS

James L. Moseley
Wayne State University School of Medicine
Detroit, MI

1987

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

J. L. Moseley

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

☐ This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.

☒ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.

• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

TM 870 267

CRITERIA FOR EVALUATING INSTRUCTIONAL PRODUCTS

What criteria are used to judge the effectiveness of a learning kit? What makes one textbook a better choice than another? What criteria are considered in evaluating non-print material? These questions are frequently directed to people with expertise in professional education. To assist our colleagues in making informed decisions about a product's educational value and other evaluative issues, the following checklist is suggested.

EVALUATION OF INSTRUCTIONAL PRODUCTS: A WORKABLE CHECKLIST

I. Product Title or Name: _____

_____

Publisher: _____

Publishing Date: _____ Unit Cost: _____

II. Type of Product: (Check appropriate description)

A. Textbook _____	F. Programmed Materials _____
B. Model _____	G. Learning Kit _____
C. Filmstrip _____	H. Instructional Module _____
D. Pamphlet _____	I. Software _____
E. Graph or Chart _____	J. Other (describe) _____

RATING SCALE (III-XVII)

COLUMN 1=YES COLUMN 2=NO COLUMN 3=UNCERTAIN COLUMN 4=NOT APPLICABLE

(Check Appropriate Column)

		1	2	3	4
III. Purpose:					
A. Is the goal of the product clearly stated?	A.				
B. Does the product accomplish what was intended?	B.				
IV. Objectives:					
A. Are objectives stated in performance terminology?	A.				
B. Are objectives sequenced in proper order?	B.				
C. Do objectives cover all aspects of the content?	C.				
D. Are objectives attainable by the learner?	D.				
V. Front End Analysis:					
A. Is the product based on needs assessment?	A.				
B. Is there evidence of instructional analysis?	B.				

RATING SCALE (III-XVII)

COLUMN 1=YES COLUMN 2=NO COLUMN 3=UNCERTAIN COLUMN 4=NOT APPLICABLE

(Check Appropriate Column)

		1	2	3	4
VI. Prerequisite Skills/Knowledge:					
A. Is there a prerequisite test of entry level skills?	A.				
B. Is there a prerequisite test of entry level knowledge?	B.				
VII. Content:					
A. Does the content meet the stated goal and objectives?	A.				
B. Is the content valid?	B.				
C. Is the subject matter content appropriately sequenced?	C.				
D. Is the content appropriate for the intended audience?	D.				
E. Is the content sufficient in quantity to cover stated objectives adequately?	E.				
F. Is the content sufficient in quality to cover stated objectives adequately?	F.				
G. Is the content factually correct?	G.				
H. Is information repeated?	H.				
VIII. Audience:					
A. Is the intended audience specified?	A.				
B. Is the vocabulary appropriate?	B.				
C. Is the reading level appropriate?	C.				
D. Is the content easily readable?	D.				
IX. Strategies and Materials:					
A. Does the product allow for learner feedback, during presentation, covering the stated objectives?	A.				
B. Is information repeated?	B.				
C. Is there a post test?	C.				
D. Are the post test items consistent with the stated objectives?	D.				
E. Are alternate methods of presentation and use of the product suggested?	E.				
F. Can the content presentation be group-based?	F.				
G. Can the content presentation be self-paced?	G.				
H. Are opportunities for further learning suggested?	H.				

RATING SCALE (III-XVII)

COLUMN 1=YES COLUMN 2=NO COLUMN 3=UNCERTAIN COLUMN 4=NOT APPLICABLE

(Check Appropriate Column)

IX. Strategies and Materials: (Continued)		1	2	3	4
I. Is the content of appropriate length?	I.				
J. Is the speed appropriate for the learner? (i.e., Does the learner have time to take notes?)	J.				
K. Can the materials be easily used by the teacher and/or learner?	K.				
L. Is the media used appropriate to objectives?	L.				
M. Are instructions for using the product clearly written and easy to follow?	M.				
N. Are the materials expendable?	N.				
O. Are the materials durable?	O.				
P. Is the instructor's manual included with the product?	P.				
Q. Does the manual suggest how the product material may be used?	Q.				
R. Does the manual indicate the necessary qualifications of teachers for using the product effectively?	R.				
S. Does the manual list field data on the product's effectiveness as an instructional aid?	S.				
T. Does the manual suggest a typical setting or time frame for its use?	T.				
U. Is the manual printed clearly?	U.				
V. Is the manual type large enough?	V.				
W. Is the manual easy to follow?	W.				
X. Technical Aspects:					
A. Does the filmstrip have visual clarity?	A.				
B. Are illustrations clear and organized effectively?	B.				
C. Are illustrations clearly explained?	C.				
D. Are illustrations appropriate to the content?	D.				
E. Does the audio medium of voice have clarity?	E.				
F. Is the background music appropriate?	F.				
G. Is speed of visual and audio portions appropriately timed?	G.				

RATING SCALE (III-XVII)

COLUMN 1=YES COLUMN 2=NO COLUMN 3=UNCERTAIN COLUMN 4=NOT APPLICABLE

(Check Appropriate Column)

		1	2	3	4
XI. Evaluation:					
A. Is a criterion-referenced test included?	A.				
B. Is there a pre-test?	B.				
C. Is there a post-test?	C.				
D. Can product be revised based on results of evaluation?	D.				
E. Does the product provide for a method of measuring learner behavior change?	E.				
F. Are test items correlated with stated objectives?	F.				
G. Can evaluation results be verified?	G.				
H. Is the learner asked to evaluate the product?	H.				
I. Was formative evaluation used in the product's development?	I.				
XII. Overall Design:					
A. Is the product systematic in its content presentation?	A.				
B. Is the length appropriate?	B.				
C. Is the instructor's manual all-inclusive?	C.				
D. Is there a glossary?	D.				
E. Is there a bibliography?	E.				
F. Is the product free of bias?	F.				
G. Does the content contain distractors?	G.				
XIII. Field Test:					
A. Has the product been field tested?	A.				
B. Has the product been revised or updated?	B.				
XIV. Physical Appeal:					
A. Does the product come attractively packaged?	A.				
B. Are the instructor's manual, filmstrip, and cassette easy to use?	B.				
C. Is the instructor's manual easy to read and follow?	C.				
D. Is the filmstrip easy to view and use?	D.				
E. Is the cassette easy to listen to and use?	E.				

RATING SCALE (III-XVII)

COLUMN 1=YES COLUMN 2=NO COLUMN 3=UNCERTAIN COLUMN 4=NOT APPLICABLE

(Check Appropriate Column)

		1	2	3	4
XIV. Physical Appeal: (Continued)					
F. Does the use of color in the filmstrip add to the effectiveness of the content, such as illustrations and diagrams?	F.				
G. Does the product stimulate appeal to the senses and imagination?	G.				
XV. Management:					
A. Is broad application possible?	A.				
B. Is necessary hardware typically available?	B.				
C. Is hardware difficult to use?	C.				
D. Are suggestions given for management of instruction?	D.				
XVI. Authorship:					
A. Is the author identified?	A.				
B. Are the author's credentials specified?	B.				
C. Was the author qualified to develop the product's contents?	C.				
D. Does the author have experience in the field the product addresses?	D.				
XVII. Cost:					
A. Is the product cost effective as a medium of learning?	A.				
B. Is the product package expensive?	B.				
C. Are replacement components of the product's package expensive?	C.				
D. Is hardware needed expensive?	D.				
E. Is time for use of product a costly factor?	E.				
F. Do teacher costs for product use go beyond contractual costs?	F.				

Narrative Comments: Use this space to make any comments about the product not covered in this checklist.